

Censorship Challenge Report – Quarter 2 FY2010
Millie Davis

Challenge reports remain steady with the number of challenges in Quarter 2 FY2010 similar to the number of challenges during the same time period in FY2009.

The catalog of challenged books listed below includes many frequently challenged books such as *Beloved*, *Adventures of Huckleberry Finn*, *Of Mice and Men*, and *Catcher in the Rye*. (In fact, *Beloved* and *Catcher in the Rye* were also challenged during the same quarter in FY2009!) Also challenged were several books new on NCTE’s list of reported challenges. These include Holly Black’s *Modern Faerie Tale*, and Tracy Chevalier’s *Girl with a Pearl Earring* and two memoirs—Jeannette Walls’ *The Glass Castle* and Julia Scheeres *Jesus Land*. The challenge to *Jesus Land* will likely cost the teacher his job.

We received an interesting challenge report concerning Lauren Myracle’s novel *Luv Ya Bunches*. Apparently when Scholastic decided to sell the novel (which had initially been published by Abrams/Amulet Books) in its book fairs, author Lauren Myracle was asked to make changes in the text to tone down some of the language (e.g. change “crap” to “stuff”), which she agreed to do. She was also asked to change character Milla’s lesbian parents to a heterosexual couple, but she refused to do that. After her refusal, Scholastic initially removed the book from the book fair circuit causing great outcry in *School Library Journal* and on social media. Scholastic reconsidered and placed the book in the middle and high school fairs’ package. The person who contacted NCTE was quite concerned because she works at an elementary school which was ready to order a Scholastic book fair but wasn’t sure they wanted to do so because *Luv Ya Bunches* (written for a preteen audience) wouldn’t be included.

Below is a chart comparing the Quarter 2 FY2010 and the Quarter 2 FY2009 challenges and numbers of challenged works and below that a list of the works challenged this quarter.

CENSORSHIP CHALLENGES COMPARISON Q2 FY10 AND Q2 FY09

A few things to know as you compare the numbers are the following:

- *Number of challenges = number of individuals who reported challenges.*
- *Number of works challenged is usually higher because often challenges involve more than one work.*
- *The bimonthly SLATE Newsletter features Censorship Challenge Reports by quarter. See <http://www.ncte.org/about/issues/slate/newsletters>*

October 2009	November 2009	December 2008	Q2 FY2010 Totals
3 challenges , 9 texts	8 challenges , 9 texts	1 challenge , 1 text/1 request for resources for a student research project	12 challenges , 19 texts/1 request for resources for a student research project
October 2008	November 2008	December 2008	Q2 FY2009 Totals
7 challenges , 13+ texts, including one to several titles from the ALA Quick Picks for Reluctant Readers, 1 request on obtaining rationales	7 challenges , including 2 library challenges and the big Tuscola, Texas challenge / 1 who wanted to challenge a book/ 1 request for information	2 challenges , 2 texts, 1 request for classroom library policy, testimony before Champaign School Board	10 challenges , 18+ texts, 1 request to obtain rationales, 1 request for classroom library policy, testimony before Champaign School Board

Adventures of Huckleberry Finn, Mark Twain (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

The Bean Trees, Barbara Kingsolver, (9th grade honors English, CA) sexual crimes against children vulgarity, molestation. Sent rationale and resources.

Beloved, Toni Morrison, (11th grade honors, OH). Not yet a challenge. Sent rationale and resources.

Beloved, Toni Morrison, (Senior AP class, IL) sexual references, bestiality. Sent rationale and resources.

Brave New World, Aldous Huxley, (10th grade honors/pre AP English II, LA) pornography without pictures. Sent rationale and resources. Other issues involved, student moved to college prep class. No action taken.

Catcher in the Rye, J. D. Salinger, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

Girl with a Pearl Earring, Tracy Chevalier, (9th grade honors English, NH) 3-sentences deemed graphic pornography. Sent resources. Superintendent is following policy to keep challenged book in curriculum.

The Glass Castle, Jeannette Walls, (9th grade honors English, CA) sexual crimes against children vulgarity, molestation. Sent resources.

Grapes of Wrath, John Steinbeck, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

The Great Gatsby, F. Scott Fitzgerald, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

How the Garcia Girls Lost Their Accents, Julia Alvarez, (Senior AP class, IL). Sent rationale.

Jesus Land, Julia Scheeres, (7th grade class library, WI) inappropriate content. Sent resources and sample letter.

Kite Runner, Khaled Hosseini, (high school assigned text, FL) language, profanity. Sent rationale and resources.

Kite Runner, Khaled Hosseini, (10th grade English curriculum, MO) parents objected and school removed from curriculum but kept in library. Sent rationale and resources.

Lord of the Flies, William Golding, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

Luv Ya Bunches, Lauren Myracle, (elementary, MD). Sent resources.

Modern Faerie Tale, Holly Black, (6-8 Media Center, GA) profanity, sexual innuendos, adult themes. Sent rationale and resources. Retained with grade-level limitation. Retained with grade-level limitation.

Of Mice and Men, John Steinbeck, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).

Their Eyes Were Watching God, Zora Neale Hurston, (high school English classes, FL) not appropriate to read out loud. Sent rationale and resources. Moving slowly and no resolution as of yet—it appears that there are extenuating circumstances adding to the problem here (discipline of a student and more).